27

28

P.14

- 1		
1		TABLE OF CONTENTS
2		
3		<u>Page</u>
4		
	I. 	BACKGROUND
5	II.	PARTIES BOUND
6	III. IV.	PARTIES BOUND
7	ν.	PAYMENT OF RESPONSE COSTS
8	vi.	FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH CONSENT DECREE
	VII.	COVENANT NOT TO SUE BY PLAINTIFF
9	VIII.	RESERVATIONS OF RIGHTS BY UNITED STATES 6
10	IX.	COVENANT NOT TO SUE BY SETTLING DEFENDANT
11	x.	EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT/CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION 8
12	XI.	RETENTION OF RECORDS
	XII.	NOTICES AND SUBMISSIONS
13	XIII.	RETENTION OF JURISDICTION
14	XIV.	INTEGRATION
15	XV.	LODGING AND OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT 13
7.0	XVI.	SIGNATORIES/SERVICE
16	XVII.	FINAL JUDGMENT , ,
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

CONSENT DECREE

BACKGROUND

A. The United States of America ("United States"), on behalf of the Administrator of the United States Coast Guard ("USCG"), filed a complaint in this matter pursuant to Section 107 of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980, 42 U.S.C. § 9607, as amended ("CERCLA"), with respect to the recovery of response costs incurred and to be incurred by the United States in connection with releases or threatened releases of hazardous substances at the Westley Tire Site at 4549 Ingram Creek Road in Westley, California (the "Site"), as a result of a tire fire that occurred on or about September 22, 1999 ("Westley Tire Fire").

- B. This Consent Decree provides for the Settling Defendant to pay Four Hundred Seventy Five Thousand Dollars (\$475,000.000) in Past Response Costs to the USCG as specified in Section V (Payment of Past Response Costs) of the Consent Decree.
- C. The United States and Settling Defendant agrees, and this Court by entering this Consent Decree finds, that this Consent Decree has been negotiated by the Parties in good faith, that settlement of this matter will avoid prolonged and complicated litigation between the Parties, and that this Consent Decree is fair, reasonable, and in the public interest.

THEREFORE, with the consent of the Parties to this Decree, it is ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED:

II. JURISDICTION

1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 and 1345 and 1355,

Section 107 of the Comprehensive Environmental Response,

Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980, 42 U.S.C. § 9607, as

amended ("CERCLA"), and also has personal jurisdiction over

Settling Defendant. Solely for the purposes of this Consent

Decree and the underlying complaint, Settling Defendant waives

all objections and defenses that they may have to jurisdiction of

the Court or to venue in this District.

III. PARTIES BOUND

2. This Consent Decree is binding upon the United States, and upon Settling Defendant. Any change in ownership or corporate or other legal status, including but not limited to, any transfer of assets or real or personal property, shall in no way alter the status or responsibilities of Settling Defendant under this Consent Decree.

IV. DEFINITIONS

- 3. Unless otherwise expressly provided herein, terms used in this Consent Decree that are defined in CERCLA or in regulations promulgated under CERCLA shall have the meanings assigned to them in CERCLA or in such regulations. Whenever terms listed below are used in this Consent Decree or in any appendix attached hereto, the following definitions shall apply:
- a. "CERCIA" shall mean the Comprehensive
 Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980,
 as amended, 42 U.S.C. § 9601, et seq.
- b. "Consent Decree" shall mean this Consent Decree.

 In the event of conflict between this Consent Decree and any
 appendix, the Consent Decree shall control.
- c. "Day" shall mean a calendar day. In computing any period of time under this Consent Decree, where the last day

4

5

б

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

would fall on a Saturday, Sunday, or federal holiday, the period shall run until the close of business of the next working day.

- d. "DOJ" shall mean the United States Department of Justice and any successor departments, agencies or instrumentalities of the United States.
- e. "Effective Date" shall be the effective date of this Consent Decree as provided in Section XV (Lodging and Opportunity for Public Comment).
- f. "EPA" shall mean the United States Environmental Protection Agency and any successor departments, agencies or instrumentalities of the United States.
- g. "EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund" shall mean the Hazardous Substance Superfund established by the Internal Revenue Code, 26 U.S.C. § 9507.
- h. "Interest" shall mean interest at the current rate specified for interest on investments of the Hazardous Substance Superfund established by 26 U.S.C. § 9507, compounded annually on October 1 of each year, in accordance with 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a).
- i. "Paragraph" shall mean a portion of this Consent

 Decree identified by an Arabic numeral or an upper or lower case

 letter.
- j. "Parties" shall mean the United States and Settling Defendant.
- k. "Past Response Costs" shall mean all costs, including but not limited to direct and indirect costs, that EPA, USCG or DOJ on behalf of EPA or USCG has paid at or in connection with the Site through the date of entry of this Consent Decree.

2

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

28

- 1. "Person" shall mean an individual, corporation, partnership, association, State, municipality, commission, or political subdivision of a State, or any interstate body.
- m. "Plaintiff" shall mean the United States of America.
- n. "Section" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree identified by a Roman numeral.
 - o. "Settling Defendant" shall mean CMS Generation Co.
- p. "Site" shall mean the Westley Tire Site located at 4549 Ingram Creek Road, Westley, California.
- q. "United States" shall mean the United States of America, including its departments, agencies and instrumentalities.
- r. "USCG" shall mean the United States Coast Guard and any successor departments, agencies or instrumentalities of the United States.

V. PAYMENT OF RESPONSE COSTS

4. Payment of Past Response Costs

- Decree Settling Defendant shall pay the sum of Four Hundred and Seventy Five Thousand Dollars (\$475,000) to the USCG.
- b. The payment specified in Section V.a. (Payment of Past Response Costs) shall be made to the USCG by Electronic Funds Transfer to the U.S. Department of Justice in accordance with instructions to be provided to Settling Defendant, following entry of the Consent Decree, by the Financial Litigation Unit of the U.S. Attorney's Office for the Eastern District of California. Such monies are to be deposited in the Oil Spill Liability Trust Fund. At the time of payment, Settling Defendant

3

4

5

б

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

shall simultaneously send written notice of payment and a copy of any transmittal documentation (which should reference DOJ case number 90-5-1-1-07881) to the Parties in accordance with Paragraph 20 of this Consent Decree (Notices and Submissions) and to:

United States Coast Guard Commander Brian Judge Office of Claims and Litigation 2100 Second Street, S.W. Washington, D.C. 20593

and

United States Coast Guard Lieutenant Commander S. Moody National Pollution Funds Center 4200 Wilson Blvd., Suite 1000 Arlington, Virginia 22203

VI. FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH CONSENT DECREE

5. <u>Interest on Late Payments</u>. If Settling Defendant fails to make any payment under Paragraph 4 (Payment of Response Costs) by the required due date, Interest shall continue to accrue on the unpaid balance through the date of payment at the rate specified in 28 U.S.C. § 1961 (a) and (b) for a money judgment.

VII. COVENANT NOT TO SUE BY PLAINTIFF

6. Covenant Not to Sue by United States. Except as specifically provided in VIII (Reservation of Rights by United States), the United States covenants not to sue or to take administrative action against Settling Defendant, and its past or present officers, directors, general partners, limited partners, parent companies (specifically limited to CMS Energy Corporation and CMS Enterprises Company), subsidiaries, heirs, successors and assigns, pursuant to Section 107(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a), Section 311 of the CWA, 33 U.S.C. § 1321, or Section 1002 of the OPA, 33 U.S.C. § 2702 for recovery of Past Response

Costs. This covenant not to sue shall take effect upon receipt by USCG of all payments required by V, Paragraph 4 (Payment of Past Response Costs). This covenant not to sue is conditioned upon the satisfactory performance by Settling Defendant of its obligations under this Consent Decree. This covenant not to sue extends only to Settling Defendant and its past or present officers, directors, general partners, limited partners, parent companies (specifically limited to CMS Energy Corporation and CMS Enterprises Company), subsidiaries, heirs, successors and assigns, and does not extend to any other person.

VIII. RESERVATIONS OF RIGHTS BY UNITED STATES

- 7. The United States reserves, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, all rights against Settling Defendant with respect to all matters not expressly included within Section VII, Covenant Not to Sue by Plaintiff, in Paragraph 6 (Covenant Not to Sue by United States) and to the extent such matters are not precluded by any applicable statute of limitations.

 Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent Decree, the United States reserves all rights against Setting Defendant, to the extent such matters are not precluded by any applicable statute of limitations, with respect to:
- a. claims based on a failure by Settling Defendant to meet a requirement of this Consent Decree;
- b. liability for costs incurred or to be incurred, if any, by the United States that are not within the definition of Past Response Costs;
- of, or loss of natural resources, and for the costs of any natural resource damage assessments;

1

- 3
- 5

- 11
- 12

- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28

- d. criminal liability; and
- liability arising from any future release of a hazardous substance, pollutant or contaminant at the Site by Settling Defendant.
- Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent Decree, USCG reserves, and this Consent Decree is without 7 prejudice to, the right to reinstitute or reopen this action, or to commence a new action seeking relief other than as provided in this Consent Decree, if the Financial Information provided by Settling Defendants is false or, in a material respect, inaccurate.
 - 9. Further notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent Decree, the United States retains all authority and reserves all rights to take any and all response actions authorized by law with respect to the Site.

COVENANT NOT TO SUE BY SETTLING DEFENDANT

- Settling Defendant covenants not to sue and agrees not to assert any claims or causes of action against the United States, or its contractors or employees, with respect to Past Response Costs or this Consent Decree, including but not limited to:
- any direct or indirect claim for reimbursement a. from the Hazardous Substance Superfund based on Sections 106(b)(2), 107, 111, 112, or 113 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606(b)(2), 9607, 9611, 9612, or 9613, or any other provision of law;
- any claim arising out of the response actions at the Site for which the Past Response Costs were incurred, including any claim under the United States Constitution, the

Constitution of the State of California, the Tucker Act, 28 U.S.C. § 1491, the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, as amended, or at common law; or

- c. any claim against the United States pursuant to Sections 107 and 113 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607 and 9613, relating to Past Response Costs.
- d. Any claim against the United States under the CWA or OPA with respect to the Westley Tire Fire, including but not limited to, any direct or indirect claim for reimbursement from the Spill Fund established pursuant to OPA, or under any provision of law, or for events arising out of removal activities in connection with the Westley Tire Fire.
- 11. Nothing in this Consent Decree shall be deemed to constitute approval or preauthorization of a claim within the meaning of Section 111 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9611, or 40 C.F.R. 300.700(d).
- 12. Settling Defendant further hereby agrees not to oppose the entry by this Court of this Consent Decree or any other Consent Decree relating to the Westley Tire Site and filed simultaneously with this Decree. Settling Defendant also agrees not to challenge any provision of this Consent Decree or any other Consent Decree relating to the Westley Tire Site and filed simultaneously with this Consent Decree, unless the United States have notified the Settling Defendant in writing that it no longer supports entry of the Consent Decree.

X. EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT/CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION

13. Nothing in this Consent Decree shall be construed to create any rights in, or grant any cause of action to, any person not a Party to this Consent Decree. The Parties expressly

reserve any and all rights (including, but not limited to, any right to contribution), defenses, claims, demands, and causes of action that they may have with respect to any matter, transaction, or occurrence relating in any way to the Site against any person not a Party hereto.

- 14. The Parties agree, and by entering this Consent Decree this Court finds, that Settling Defendant is entitled, as of the date of entry of this Consent Decree, to protection from contribution actions or claims as provided by Section 113(f)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(f)(2), for "matters addressed" in this Consent Decree. The "matters addressed" in this Consent Decree are Past Response Costs.
- suit or claim for contribution brought by it for matters related to this Consent Decree, it will notify USCG and DOJ in writing no later than sixty (60) days prior to the initiation of such suit or claim. Settling Defendant also agrees that, with respect to any suit or claim for contribution brought against it for matters related to this Consent Decree, it will notify USCG and DOJ in writing within ten (10) days of service of the complaint or claim upon it. In addition, Settling Defendant shall notify USCG and DOJ within ten (10) days of service or receipt of any Motion for Summary Judgment, and within ten (10) days of receipt of any order from a court setting a case for trial, for matters related to this Consent Decree.
- 16. In any subsequent administrative or judicial proceeding initiated by the United States for injunctive relief, recovery of response costs, or other relief relating to the Site, Settling Defendant shall not assert, and may not maintain, any defense or

12

13

15

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

1 claim based upon the principles of waiver, res judicata, collateral estoppel, issue preclusion, claim-splitting, or other defenses based upon any contention that the claims raised by the United States in the subsequent proceeding were or should have been brought in the instant case; provided, however, that nothing in this Paragraph affects the enforceability of the Covenant Not to Sue by Plaintiff set forth in Section VII (Covenant Not to Sue by Plaintiff) or Settling Defendant's right to assert any appropriate defense or claim in any subsequent proceeding by the United States relating to matters not addressed in this Consent Decree with respect to the Westley Tire Site.

RETENTION OF RECORDS XI.

- 17. Until two (2) years after the entry of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendant shall preserve and retain all records, reports, or information (hereinafter referred to as "records") now in its possession or control, or which come into its possession or control, that relate in any manner to response actions taken at the Site or the liability of any person under CERCLA with respect to the Site, regardless of any corporate retention policy to the contrary.
- After the conclusion of the two (2) year document retention period in the preceding Paragraph, Settling Defendant shall notify USCG and DOJ at least ninety (90) days prior to the destruction of any such records, and, upon request by USCG or DOJ, Settling Defendant shall deliver any such records to USCG. Settling Defendant may assert that certain records are privileged under the attorney-client privilege or any other privilege recognized by federal law. If Settling Defendant asserts such a privilege, it shall provide Plaintiff with the following: 1) the

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 | title of the record; 2) the date of the record; 3) the name, title, affiliation (e.g., company or firm), and address of the author of the record; 4) the name and title of each addressee and recipient; 5) a description of the subject of the record; and 6) the privilege asserted. If a claim of privilege applies only to a portion of a record, the record shall be provided to Plaintiff in redacted form to mask the privileged information only. Settling Defendant shall retain all records that it claims to be privileged until the United States has had a reasonable opportunity to dispute the privilege claim and any such dispute has been resolved in the Settling Defendant's favor. However, no records created or generated pursuant to the requirements of this or any other settlement with the USCG pertaining to the Site shall be withheld on the grounds that they are privileged.

19. Settling Defendant hereby certifies that, to the best of its knowledge and belief, after thorough inquiry, it has not altered, mutilated, discarded, destroyed or otherwise disposed of any records, reports, or information relating to its potential liability regarding the Site since notification of potential liability by the United States or the State or the filing of suit against it regarding the Site and that it has fully complied with any and all USCG requests for information pursuant to Sections 104(e) and 122(e) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9604(e) and 9622(e), and Section 3007 of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6972.

NOTICES AND SUBMISSIONS XII.

20. Whenever, under the terms of this Consent Decree, notice is required to be given or a document is required to be sent by one party to another, it shall be directed to the individuals at the addresses specified below, unless those

```
individuals or their successors give notice of a change in
   writing. Written notice as specified herein shall constitute
   complete satisfaction of any written notice requirement of the
3
   Consent Decree with respect to the United States, USCG, DOJ, and
   Settling Defendant, respectively.
6
   AS TO THE UNITED STATES:
   As to DOJ:
        Chief, Environmental Enforcement Section
9
        Environment and Natural Resources Division
        U.S. Department of Justice DJ # 90-5-1-1-07881
10
        P.O. Box 7611
        Washington, D.C.
                          20044-7611
11
        Angela O'Connell, Senior Counsel
12
        Environmental Enforcement Section
        U.S. Department of Justice
13
        301 Howard Street, Suite 1050
        San Francisco, California 94105
14
        DJ # 90-5-1-1-07881
   As to USCG:
15
        Lieutenant Commander Sanders Moody
16
        National Pollution Funds Center
        Ballston Common Office Building, Suite 1000
17
        4200 Wilson Boulevard
        Arlington, Virginia 22203
18
   AS TO SETTLING DEFENDANT:
19
        Chris M. Amantea, Esq.
20
        McDermott, Will & Emery
        2049 Century Park East, 34th Floor
21
        Los Angeles, California 90067
   With a copy to:
23
        Julio Mazzoli, Esq.
        CMS Generation Co.
24
        One Energy Plaza
        Jackson, Michigan 49201
25
26
27
```

l

2

3

5

б

11

12

13

16

17

20

21

23

24

25

26

27

28

XIII. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

21. This Court shall retain jurisdiction over this matter for the purpose of interpreting and enforcing the terms of this Consent Decree.

XIV. INTEGRATION

22. This Consent Decree constitutes the final, complete, and exclusive agreement and understanding among the Parties with respect to the settlement embodied in this Consent Decree. The Parties acknowledge that there are no representations, agreements or understandings relating to the settlement other than those expressly contained in this Consent Decree.

XV. LODGING AND OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT

- 23. This Consent Decree shall be lodged with the Court for a period of not less than thirty (30) days for public notice and comment. The United States reserves the right to withdraw or withhold its consent if the comments regarding the Consent Decree disclose facts or considerations that indicate that this Consent Decree is inappropriate, improper, or inadequate. Settling Defendant consents to the entry of this Consent Decree without further notice.
- 24. If for any reason this Court should decline to approve this Consent Decree in the form presented, this agreement is voidable at the sole discretion of any party and the terms of the agreement may not be used as evidence in any litigation between the Parties.

XVI. SIGNATORIES/SERVICE

25. Each undersigned representative of Settling Defendant to this Consent Decree and the Associate Attorney General, for the Environment and Natural Resources Division of the United

States Department of Justice certifies that he or she is
authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this Consent
Decree and to execute and bind legally such Party to this
document.

26. Settling Defendant hereby agrees not to oppose entry of this Consent Decree by this Court or to challenge any provision of this Consent Decree, unless the United States has notified Settling Defendant in writing that it no longer supports entry of the Consent Decree.

Moreover, Settling Defendant hereby agrees not to oppose entry of, or to challenge any provisions of, any other Consent Decree relating to the Westley Tire Site lodged with this Court simultaneously with this Consent Decree, unless the United States has notified Settling Defendant in writing that it no longer supports entry of the Consent Decree.

27. Settling Defendant shall identify, on the attached signature page, the name and address of an agent who is authorized to accept service of process by mail on behalf of that Party with respect to all matters arising under or relating to this Consent Decree. Settling Defendant hereby agrees to accept service in that manner and to waive the formal service requirements set forth in Rule 4 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and any applicable local rules of this Court, including but not limited to, service of a summons. The Parties agree that Settling Defendant need not file a response to the complaint in this action unless or until the Court expressly declines to enter this Consent Decree.

FINAL JUDGMENT XVII.

28. Upon approval and entry of this Consent Decree by the Court, this Consent Decree shall constitute the final judgment between and among the United States and the Settling Defendant. The Court finds that there is no just reason for delay and therefore enters this judgment as a final judgment under Fed. R. Civ. P. 54 and 58. SO ORDERED THIS ____ , 20___ , 20___ .

United States District Judge

THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY enters into this Consent Decree in the matter of United 1 States v. Modesto Energy Limited Partnership, Modesto Environmental Corp., Enpower 2 Management Corp., and CMS Generation Co., Civil Action No. _____, relating to the 3 Westley Tire Site. 4 5 FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA 6 7 8 Date: 5.11.04 9 THOMAS L. SANSONETTI Assistant Attorney General 10 Environment & Natural Resources Division 11 Environment and Natural Resources Division U.S. Department of Justice 12 Washington, D.C. 20530 13 United States Attorney 14 15 16 Angela O'Connell 17 Senior Counsel Environmental Enforcement Section 18 Environment and Natural Resources Division 19 U.S. Department of Justice P.O. Box 7611 20 Washington, D.C. 20044-7611 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28

1	THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY enters into this Consent Decree, as of
2	December 31, 2003, in the matter of United States v. CMS
3	Generation Co., Civil Action No, relating to the
4	Westley Superfund Site.
5	
б	For the United States Coast Guard
7	
8	
9	Commander Brian Judge Office of Claims and Litigation
10	U.S. Coast Guard 2100 2nd Street, SW
11	Washington DC 20593-0001
12	
13	Lt. Commander Sanders Moody
14	Legal Counsel U.S. Coast Guard National Pollution Funds Center
15	4200 Wilson Blvd., Suite 1000 Arlington VA 22203-1804
16	A111119CO11 VA 22203-1804
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

1	THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY enters into this Consent Decree, as of
2	December 31, 2003, in the matter of United States v. CMS
3	Generation Co., Civil Action No, relating to the
4	Westley Superfund Site.
5	
6	FOR CMS GENERATION CO.
7	
8	
9	Date: February 25, 2004 THOMAS W. ELWARD
10	President and CEO CMS Generation Co.
11	One Energy Plaza Jackson, Michigan 49201-2276
12	Agent Authorized to Accept Service on Behalf of Above-signed
13	Party:
14	
15	Name: Chris M. Amantea, Esq.
16	Title: Attorney
17	Address: McDermott, Will & Emery 2049 Century Park East, 34th Floor
18	Los Angeles, California 90067
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25 26	
25	
28	
. U	